Seeing Like a Platform

Chris Hoofnagle

Machines of Manipulation Panel

23rd Annual BCLT/BTLJ Symposium Governing Machines:
Defining and Enforcing Public Policy Values in AI Systems
...Where are the answers? In transparency, equal protection, consumer protection, data protection, election law, or other areas?
Scott’s High Modernism

• Simplifications that order of nature and society (capacity)
  • Interested, utilitarian, documentary, standardized fact gathering

• Belief in ability to design social order (will)

• Authoritarian high modernism adds coercive power of the state (mechanism)
“The only thing that matters is the future,” he told me after the civil trial was settled. “I don’t even know why we study history. It’s entertaining, I guess—the dinosaurs and the Neanderthals and the Industrial Revolution, and stuff like that. But what already happened doesn’t really matter. You don’t need to know that history to build on what they made. In technology, all that matters is tomorrow.”

Charles Duhigg, Did Uber Steal Google’s Intellectual Property?, New Yorker, Oct. 22, 2018
(Quoting former Google AV lead, Anthony Levandowski).
Larry Page wants to 'set aside a part of the world' for unregulated experimentation while being interviewed by Charlie Rose, Page said last year and he agreed to a plan that upon his death, rather than giving his fortune to charity, he would establish a new organization or bequeathing it to his heirs, he said. Unlike Elon Musk, the founder of SpaceX and Tesla Motors, who is an old-school kind of visionary whose ideas will do untold amounts of good, Page set his sights on a much bigger and more audacious goal: defining the future of humanity itself.
Where in the World Is Larry Page?

While Alphabet faces existential challenges, its co-founder is exercising his right to be forgotten.
“Personally I think the idea that fake news on Facebook, which is a very small amount of the content, influenced the election in any way — I think is a pretty crazy idea. Voters make decisions based on their lived experience.” – Mark Zuckerberg

• This quote makes sense if you “see like a platform”
  • i.e. UGC is junk.
  • Quality doesn’t scale.
• Zuboff: surveillance capitalism is an affront to liberal enlightenment norms
• Who knows (Google and Facebook)
• Who decides (Google and Facebook)
• Who decides who decides...
Zuboff continued...

• Schmidt’s “hiding strategy”

• “Larry opposed any path that would reveal our technological secrets or stir the privacy pot and endanger our ability to gather data”
  • Page opposed Google Zeitgeist & the board that displayed searches in real time (these made clear that Google could see searches)

• Zuboff: a revolution from the top
The silver lining

• High modernists schemes are apt to fail
  • But they can fail in disastrous ways
What to do? Consider return to Scott--

• High modernism becomes most dangerous when combined with coercive power of the state
  • Google Toronto & ”smart cities”
• Strengthen barriers against high modernism
  • The private sphere
  • Civil society
  • Liberal economic order (yes, capitalism!)
  • Affordances for human ingenuity and diversity
• Hoofnagle: introduce *quality* (reevaluate “free,” CDA §230)
• Zuboff: ban surveillance capitalism
• Lanier: propertize data & internet-intermediated labor